

Contents

<i>Abbreviations</i>	iii
<i>Figures</i>	v
<i>Tables</i>	viii
Executive Summary	1
Ringkasan Eksekutif	8
1. Introduction	16
1.1 The study	17
1.2 Perspectives and objectives of the study	18
1.3 Focus of the study	19
1.4 Knowledge deliverables	20
1.5 The structure of the report	20
2. Framework for the study and key observations	22
2.1 Skills and related concepts	23
2.2 Framing skill issues of higher qualified labour: Perspectives	24
2.3 Identifying and measuring skill gaps and shortages: Indicators	30
2.4 Setting the scene: Key observations on Penang	32
3. Approach and methodological notes	44
3.1 Exploration: Desk research and discussions with industry experts	45
3.2 Selection of priority industries	46
3.3 Approach to the study and information gathering methods	46
3.4 Methodological steps	47
3.5 Templates for discussion of (industry) results	61
3.6 Implementation obstacles and methodological limitations	61
4. High-qualified labour and skills: The demand side	64
4.1 Penang's next economy and skill demand	65
4.2 Labour demand shifts	71
4.3 Profiles that are considered as critical by the market	90
4.4 Projected labour demand suggested by the employer survey	94
4.5 Evolving nature of work	95
5. High-qualified labour and skills: The supply side	98
5.1 Overview of Penang workforce	99
5.2 Availability of high-qualified labour	102
5.3 Skill supply	107
5.4 Skill shortages	114
5.5 Competition for skills	121
6. Skill deficiencies and gaps: Upskilling infrastructure	124
6.1 Framework	125

6.2	Primary skills learning infrastructure	126
6.3	High-qualified entrants: Extent and causes of skill deficiencies	126
6.4	Secondary supply: Skill gaps	132
6.5	Overcoming issues and skill gaps	136
6.6	Regional and local institutional initiatives to enhance human talent	140
6.7	Skill augmentation initiatives	142
7.	High-qualified labour and skills in core manufacturing industries	144
7.1	High-tech manufacturing: Industrial electronics, semiconductors and optoelectronics	145
7.2.	Other high-tech manufacturing: Electronics manufacturing services, telecommunication products, and magnetic & optical recording storage	151
7.3	Precision engineering, machining and automation	158
7.4	Life sciences and medical devices	164
7.5	Comparative analysis across core manufacturing industries	170
8.	High-qualified labour and skills in growing services industries	172
8.1	Advanced producer services	173
8.2	Global business services	178
8.3	Hospitality services	184
8.4	Medical tourism	188
8.5	Information technology	192
8.6	Transport and logistics	198
8.7	Education and training services	202
8.8	Comparative analysis across growing services industries	206
9.	Mobility of high-qualified labour	208
9.1	High-qualified labour mobility in Malaysia	209
9.2	Mobility I: Labour flow analysis in Penang	211
9.3	Mobility II: How growing GBS activities drive labour circulation	218
9.4	Mobility drivers of GBS industry	226
9.5	High-qualified labour: Turnover and retention issues	227
10.	Augmenting skills for the next economy: Ideas for a skills strategy	234
10.1	A skills strategy	235
10.2	Skills strategy: Components	237
10.3	Ideas for short-term initiatives	237
10.4	Conclusions	249
	Bibliography	250

Abbreviations

ACCA	Association of Chartered Certified Accountants
AMMI	Association of Malaysian Medical Industries
APHA	Association of Private Hospitals of Malaysia
APS	Advanced Producer Services
BDA	Big Data Analytics
BKIP	Batu Kawan Industrial Park
BPO	Business Process Outsourcing
CAT	Career, Assistance and Training
CCNA	Cisco Certified Network Associate
Cedefop	Centre for the Development of Vocational Training
CGPA	Cumulative Grade Points Average
CIPE	Capital Investment per Employee ratio
CNC	Computer Numerical Control
COL	Critical Occupation List
CPA	Certified Public Accountant
CREST	Collaborative Research in Engineering, Science and Technology
CSC	Critical Skills Monitoring Committee
CSL	Critical Skills List
CV	Curriculum Vitae
DFTZ	Digital Free Trade Zone
DOSM	Department of Statistics Malaysia
E & E	Electrical and Electronic
EMS	Electronics Manufacturing Services
EPF	Employee Provident Fund
ERP	Enterprise Resource Planning
E-to-E	Employer-to-employer
ETP	Economic Transformation Program
EU	European Union
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FMCG	Fast Moving Consumer Goods
FMM	Federation of Malaysian Manufacturers
GaWC	Globalisation and World Cities
GBS	Global Business Services
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GRP	Gross Regional Product
HR	Human Resource
HRDF	Human Resources Development Fund
HRM	Human Resource Management
HTFV	Hard-To-Fill Vacancies
ICT	Information and Communications Technology
IEAP	Industry Expert Advisory Panel
ILMIA	Institute for Labour Market Information and Analysis
IoT	Internet of Things
IP	Internet Protocol
ISIC	International Standard Industrial Classification
IC	Integrated Circuit
IT	Information Technology
ITO	Information Technology Outsourcing
KPO	Knowledge Process Outsourcing
LED	Light-Emitting Diode
LLC	Local Large Companies

MAC	Migration Advisory Committee
MAICSA	Malaysia Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators
MASCO	Malaysia Standard Classification of Occupation
MBA	Master of Business Administration
MBPP	Majlis Bandaraya Pulau Pinang (Penang City Council)
MCSE	Microsoft Certified Solutions Expert
MDEC	Malaysia Digital Economy Corporation
MFRS	Malaysian Financial Reporting Standard
MICCI	Malaysian International Chamber Of Commerce and Industry
MICE	Meetings, Incentives, Conferencing, Exhibitions
MIDA	Malaysian Investment Development Authority
MNC	Multinational Corporation
MOHE	Ministry of Higher Education
MOHR	Ministry of Human Resource
MPER	Malaysian Private Entity Reporting
MPSP	Majlis Perbandaran Seberang Perai (Seberang Perai Municipal Council)
MQA	Malaysian Qualification Agency
MSC	Multimedia Super Corridor
MSIC	Malaysian Standard Industrial Classification
NCER	Northern Corridor Economic Region
NCIA	Northern Corridor Implementation Authority
NKEA	National Key Economic Area
NPI	New Product Introduction
O&G	Oil and Gas
ODM	Original Design Manufacturing
PAC	Penang Automation Cluster
PC	Personal computer
PCCC	Penang Chinese Chamber of Commerce
PCET	Penang Centre of Education Tourism
Penang CAT	Penang Career Assistance and Talent Centre
PENFEIA	Penang Foundry & Engineering Industries Association
PR	Permanent Resident
PSC	Public Service Commission
PSDC	Penang Skills Development Centre
QA	Quality Assurance
R&D	Research and Development
REP	Returning Expert Programme
ROC	Registrar of Companies
RPGT	Real Property Gains Tax
RP-T	Residence Pass-Talent
SMART Centre	Small and Medium Enterprises Market Advisory Resource and Training Centre
SME	Small and Medium Enterprise
SOCISO	Social Security Organisation
sPICE	Subterranean Penang International Convention and Exhibition
SSC	Shared Service Centre
SSM	Suruhanjaya Syarikat Malaysia
SSO	Shared Service Outsourcing
STEM	Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UiTM	Universiti Teknologi MARA
UKCES	United Kingdom Commission for Employment and Skills
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
USM	Universiti Sains Malaysia
WOU	Wawasan Open University

Figures

Figure 1.1	Three perspectives in the study of Penang skill gaps and shortages	19
Figure 1.2	Knowledge deliverables	20
Figure 2.1	A typology of skills	23
Figure 2.2	Concepts related to skills	23
Figure 2.3	Skill shortages as distinct from skill gaps	24
Figure 2.4	Three perspectives of skill issues	24
Figure 2.5	Causes of skill shortages and gaps	25
Figure 2.6	Economic structure and labour market function under different conditions	27
Figure 2.7	Inter-linkage of the market, industry/firm and worker perspectives on skill issues in a local labour market	28
Figure 2.8	Consequences of skill gaps and shortages at economy and industry/firm levels	29
Figure 2.9	Selected strategies to address skill gaps and shortages	29
Figure 2.10	Vacancies and applications received in the top 20 specialisations in the first half of 2015	34
Figure 2.11	Reversal of a skills pyramid	36
Figure 2.12	Compartmentalisation of the Penang economy and skilled labour attraction/retention	37
Figure 3.1	Industry focus of this study	46
Figure 3.2	Set-up of the study	47
Figure 3.3	Components of the study and elaboration in steps	48
Figure 4.1	Industrial development in Penang, 1960–2010	65
Figure 4.2	Value-added roadmap – the Penang story	66
Figure 4.3	Growth rates of national GDP and Penang's GRP, 2006–2015*(%)	68
Figure 4.4	Approved manufacturing investments and employment created in Penang, 2008-2016	72
Figure 4.5	Capital investment per employee (ratio RM '000) and GDP growth rate (%) in Penang, 2008-2016	72
Figure 4.6	Job vacancies, job placements and vacancy fill rates in Penang, 2006–2015	75
Figure 4.7	New job vacancies by major industries in Penang, 2015	76
Figure 4.8	The ratio of unemployment to job vacancy (job seeker) in Penang, 2006–2015	76
Figure 4.9	Job vacancies posted in the top 10 job specialisations within the Northern Region in Malaysia, 2015 vs 2016	77
Figure 4.10	Unique job vacancies by industry type in Penang, 31 December 2015–30 June 2016	78
Figure 4.11	Job positions by major job titles advertised in Penang	81
Figure 4.12	Job positions and industry type by major job titles in Penang (in number and %)	82
Figure 4.13	Generic hard, specific hard and soft skill requirements by firm size	89
Figure 4.14	Generic hard, specific hard and soft skill requirements by position level	89
Figure 4.15	Soft skill sets required in top positions	90
Figure 4.16	Reasons for acquiring new skills as a result of newly emerging tasks	94
Figure 4.17	Projected technological pathway in Penang	97
Figure 5.1	Labour force growth in Penang, 2005-2015	99
Figure 5.2	Labour force participation rate in Malaysia and Penang, 1982–2016 (%)	100
Figure 5.3	Labour force participation rate by gender in Penang, 2005–2015	100
Figure 5.4	Unemployment rate in Penang and Malaysia, 1982–2016	100
Figure 5.5	Number and annual growth rate of employed persons in Penang, 1990–2015	101
Figure 5.6	Share of employed persons by economic sector in Penang, 1990-2015	101
Figure 5.7	Share of employed persons by educational attainment in Penang, 2005-2016 (%)	102
Figure 5.8	Employment numbers of tertiary-educated and high-skilled occupations in Penang, 2005–2015	103
Figure 5.9	In-, out- and net migrants in Penang, 2002–2016	104
Figure 5.10	Brain drain by occupation in Malaysia, 2014	106

Figure 5.11	Percentage of employed persons by skills spectrum in Penang, 1990–2016	107
Figure 5.12	Number of times high-skilled positions have been advertised by employers from December 2015 to June 2016	108
Figure 5.13	Responses on recruitment channels	108
Figure 5.14	Main reason for advertising high-qualified positions	109
Figure 5.15	Where do firms recruit labour for high-qualified positions?	109
Figure 5.16	How often does this establishment accede to candidates' demands? (%)	121
Figure 5.17	Strategies used by firms to overcome skill shortages (% of firms)	122
Figure 6.1	Penang skills learning infrastructure	125
Figure 6.2	Employment status of graduates six months after graduation in Malaysia, 2015	126
Figure 6.3	Percentage of graduate unemployment by education level in Malaysia between 2010 and 2015 (%)	127
Figure 6.4	Unemployment rate by age groups in Penang, 2016	127
Figure 6.5	Graduates by fields of study in Malaysia, 2006–2015 (%)	128
Figure 6.6	Graduates by fields of study and employment status in Malaysia, 2006–2015	129
Figure 6.7	Fields of study in Malaysian public universities of graduates originating from Penang, 2008–2015	129
Figure 6.8	Fields of study of graduates in public universities in Penang, 2008–2015 (%)	130
Figure 6.9	Firm rating of skills proficiency level of current employees by specific types of skills	133
Figure 6.10	Average share of employees in top five high-qualified job positions that are fully skilled	134
Figure 6.11	Impacts of skill gaps of current employees (%)	135
Figure 6.12	Measures taken to address skill deficiencies	136
Figure 6.13	Share of employers' responses to training/upskilling for addressing skill gaps and skill shortages	136
Figure 6.14	Nature of skills training by type of skill situations	139
Figure 6.15	Factors negatively impact investment in training	139
Figure 6.16	Reasons preventing organisations from providing skills training to remedy skill shortages	140
Figure 6.17	Reasons preventing organisations from providing skills training to remedy skill gaps	140
Figure 6.18	The NCER human capital development plan	141
Figure 7.1	Major job titles advertised in high-tech manufacturing industry in Penang	146
Figure 7.2	High-demand jobs by types of skills and position levels	146
Figure 7.3	Top 10 jobs advertised by major job titles and educational requirements	147
Figure 7.4	Persistent job vacancies by types of skills and major job titles	147
Figure 7.5	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills in high-tech manufacturing in Penang	150
Figure 7.6	Major job titles advertised in other high-tech manufacturing industries	152
Figure 7.7	High-demand jobs by types of skills and position levels	153
Figure 7.8	High-demand major job titles by types of skills in other high-tech manufacturing industries	153
Figure 7.9	Persistent job vacancies by types of skills and major job titles	155
Figure 7.10	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills in other high-tech manufacturing in Penang	157
Figure 7.11	Major job titles advertised in precision engineering, tooling & machining and automation	159
Figure 7.12	High-demand job positions by types of skills and position levels	160
Figure 7.13	Persistent vacancies by types of skills and major job titles	163
Figure 7.14	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills in precision engineering, machining and automation in Penang	164
Figure 7.15	Major job titles advertised in life sciences and medical devices	165
Figure 7.16	High-demand job positions by types of skills and position levels	166
Figure 7.17	High-demand of major job functions by types of skills	166
Figure 7.18	Persistent job vacancies by types of skills and major job titles	168
Figure 7.19	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills	169

Figure 8.1	Major job titles advertised in advanced producer services	174
Figure 8.2	High-demand jobs by types of skills and position levels	175
Figure 8.3	Top jobs advertised by major job titles and educational requirements	175
Figure 8.4	Persistent job vacancies by types of skills and major job titles	176
Figure 8.5	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills	178
Figure 8.6	Major job titles advertised in global business services	180
Figure 8.7	High-demand jobs by types of skills and position levels	181
Figure 8.8	High-demand major job titles by types of skills	181
Figure 8.9	Persistent job vacancies by types of skills and major job titles	182
Figure 8.10	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills	184
Figure 8.11	Major job titles advertised in hospitality services	185
Figure 8.12	High-demand jobs by types of skills and position levels	185
Figure 8.13	High-demand jobs by types of skills and major job titles	185
Figure 8.14	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills	188
Figure 8.15	Major job titles advertised in medical tourism	189
Figure 8.16	High-demand jobs by types of skills and position levels	190
Figure 8.17	High-demand major job titles by types of skills	190
Figure 8.18	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills	192
Figure 8.19	Major job titles advertised in information technology	194
Figure 8.20	High-demand jobs by types of skills and position levels	194
Figure 8.21	High-demand jobs by types of skills and major job titles	194
Figure 8.22	Persistent vacancies by types of skills and major job titles	196
Figure 8.23	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills	198
Figure 8.24	Major job titles advertised in transport and logistics	199
Figure 8.25	High-demand job positions by types of skills and position levels	199
Figure 8.26	High-demand job positions by types of skills and major job titles	199
Figure 8.27	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills	202
Figure 8.28	Major job titles advertised in education and training services	203
Figure 8.29	High-demand job positions by types of skills and position levels	203
Figure 8.30	High-demand job positions by types of skills and major job titles	203
Figure 8.31	The skills proficiency level of current high-qualified employees by types of skills	205
Figure 9.1	Sectoral moves between 2001 and 2005 (N = 681)	212
Figure 9.2	Labour flow by industry between 2001 and 2005	213
Figure 9.3	Sectoral moves between 2006 and 2010 (N = 2,237)	214
Figure 9.4	Labour flow by industry between 2006 and 2010	215
Figure 9.5	Sectoral moves between 2011 and 2016 (N = 11,711)	216
Figure 9.6	Labour flow by industry between 2011 and 2016 (N= 8,785)	217
Figure 9.7	Labour moves from third-previous job to second-previous job	219
Figure 9.8	Labour moves from second-previous job to former job	219
Figure 9.9	Labour moves from former job to current job	220
Figure 9.10	Former function of employees currently employed in BPO	223
Figure 9.11	Former function of employees currently employed in the BPO/ITO sector	224
Figure 9.12	Former function of employees currently employed in the ITO sector	225
Figure 9.13	Job functions that are particularly prone to labour turnover by industry (%)	228
Figure 9.14	Incentives to retain existing highly proficient employees (%)	229
Figure 9.15	Career opportunities provided to employees (%)	230
Figure 9.16	Basic characteristics of employee engagement (%)	232
Figure 9.17	A Malaysian perspective on engagement drivers	232
Figure 10.1	Basic principles of a skills strategy	236
Figure 10.2	Skills strategy objectives in time perspective	237
Figure 10.3	The basic components of a skills strategy	237
Figure 10.4	Some indicators for the success of short-term strategic initiatives	249

Tables

Table 1.1	Industry focus in brief	19
Table 2.1	Indicators of skill shortages and gaps from macro, meso and micro (firms and workers) perspectives	31
Table 3.1	Detailed description of tasks in preliminary phase	45
Table 3.2	Detailed description of tasks in Component 1	48
Table 3.3	Macro level variables, indicators and sources	50
Table 3.4	Detailed description of tasks in Component 2	54
Table 3.5	Institutions that provide company lists	56
Table 3.6	Meso-level variables, indicators and sources	57
Table 3.7	Micro-level variables, indicators and sources	57
Table 3.8	Detailed description of tasks in Component 3	59
Table 4.1	Malaysia GDP and Penang's GRP growth and share percentage, 2006 and 2016	67
Table 4.2	Key economic areas	69
Table 4.3	Key industries for which Penang has the competencies to further develop	70
Table 4.4	Existing innovation initiatives in Penang (excluding corporate R&D)	70
Table 4.5	Approved manufacturing investment by top five industry groups in Penang, 2011–2016	73
Table 4.6	Jobs created by new and existing companies in Penang from 2015–2021	74
Table 4.7	Top recruiting companies in Penang, 31 December 2015–30 June 2016	78
Table 4.8	Summary statistics of the characteristics of job positions	80
Table 4.9	Type of candidates targeted for hiring by firms	81
Table 4.10	Vacancy characteristics of major job positions in Penang	83
Table 4.11	Skill profiles of major job titles in Penang	85
Table 4.12	The relevance of national COL to Penang*	92
Table 4.13	Key technology trends currently occurring, impinging on work trends	96
Table 4.14	Job transformation implications of prospective technological pathway	97
Table 5.1	Top five states with tertiary-educated labour force in Malaysia, 2016	103
Table 5.2	Size of the Malaysian diaspora (age 0+) and brain drain (age 25+), by country of destination over time in numbers and % difference	106
Table 5.3	Employers' responses towards average number of applicants for advertised vacancies	110
Table 5.4	Success rate in filling vacant high-qualified positions	111
Table 5.5	Firms' opinion on applicants for high-qualified positions meeting most of the stipulated requirements	111
Table 5.6	Over the past two years, has this establishment hired applicants that actually fail to meet requirements (in full)?	112
Table 5.7	Reasons for vacant high-qualified positions not being filled (%)	113
Table 5.8	Impacts of labour recruitment difficulties (in % of firms)	114
Table 5.9	Summary statistics of characteristics of job positions	115
Table 5.10	The Penang COL in terms of relevance of occupations and hard-to-fill occupations*	116
Table 5.11	Specific job titles within top hard-to-fill occupations* in Penang	118
Table 5.12	Over the past two years, has your company experienced vacant high-qualified positions that proved to be hard to fill? (in % by firm size)	119
Table 5.13	Over the past two years, has your company experienced vacant high-qualified positions that proved to be hard to fill?	120
Table 5.14	Hard-to-fill job titles and position levels obtained from employer survey	120
Table 5.15	Do these establishments provide special incentives to hire a candidate who is proficient in the required skills (e.g. salary above the market rate)?	121
Table 5.16	Strategies to overcome skill shortages by sectors and firms size	122

Table 6.1	Skills that need most improvement by firm size (%)	135
Table 7.1	Description of sub-industries of high-tech manufacturing in Penang	145
Table 7.2	Hard-to-fill job positions over the past two years	149
Table 7.3	List of firms exiting manufacturing operations in Penang as of October 2016	152
Table 7.4	Description of sub-industries of other high-tech manufacturing in Penang	152
Table 7.5	Reasons for high-qualified positions not being filled	156
Table 7.6	Hard-to-fill job positions over the past two years	156
Table 7.7	Description of sub-industries of precision engineering, tooling & machining and automation	159
Table 7.8	Hard-to-fill job positions over the past two years	162
Table 7.9	Description of sub-industries of life sciences and medical devices	165
Table 8.1	Description of sub-industries of advanced producer services	173
Table 8.2	Description of sub-industries of global business services (GBS)	179
Table 8.3	Description of sub-industries of information technology	193
Table 9.1	The characteristics of respondents' job changes	218
Table 9.2	Changes from former employment in manufacturing to current GBS employment	220
Table 9.3	Shifts from an existing internal department to a (newly established) GBS department of the same company	221
Table 9.4	Mobility from AMD Global Services to other SSCs in Penang	221
Table 9.5	Some cases of employees whose current job is not skill-related with former job and education	222
Table 9.6	Reasons for working in the GBS sector ranked by importance	226
Table 9.7	Levels of satisfaction of respondents with the following aspects	227